



Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

> The assurance I have is what I know from experience and study about repair  
> installations (aka in-place upgrades), what they do and what they don't  
> do. They replace operating system files and embedded system components  
> relative to the service pack level being used for the repair install. SP1  
> doesn't know about the Firewall and Security Center control panel items of  
> SP2. Apparently they are more along the lines of applications (applets),  
> and they were rendered non-functional because they apparently depend on  
> SP2 versions of system files, which were replaced by SP1 versions by the  
> SP1 repair install. The errors stated "a file needed was not found"  
> indicates that.

Possibly, but can you guarantee this?

>  
>>  
>> Have you checked all the files to be sure all are the correct version?  
>> "the actual system files in use are SP1 versions"  
>  
> I assumed they were SP1 versions or the system would not function  
> correctly and Windows File Protection would have kicked in if a protected  
> system file was the wrong version.

Assuming is a good way of believing an insecure computer is secure.

>  
>> How did you verify all of them?  
>  
> I didn't, I admit I made the assumption since the systems worked fine for  
> me and others.

Same answer as above.

>  
>>  
>> "as I'm sure any SP2 specific registry"  
>> "since they are no longer tied to the OS"  
>  
> You're snipping my sentences so they don't make complete sense. I wish you  
> wouldn't do that. It's misleading and confusing.

They may have been snipped but the complete sentence from the previous post  
was left for reference if necessary.

>  
>> Why are you sure?  
>> What demonstrates all necessary files are correct?  
>  
> The fact that it works.

An operating system is very complex.

"it works" leaves a lot of room for a problem caused by a bad uninstall to  
show itself when an appropriate feature is needed.

>  
>> How do you know what is tied to what?

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

>  
> By paying attention and learning from the experiment, I'm still learning,  
> BTW.  
>  
>>  
>> I do not need to attempt this, I have not stated either way whether it  
>> will work or not.  
>  
> I didn't say you should try it or that you said it would or would not  
> work, you said his system is not behaving like an sp1 installation:  
>  
>> Jupiter Jones [MVP] wrote:  
>>  
>>> Yours is not a good example.  
>>> Your computer is also not behaving as an SP-1 installation.  
>  
> And I asked:  
>  
> "How can you determine that it is not behaving like an SP1 installation?  
> Have you done it and are you using a machine that you've done it to?"  
>  
> Obviously you haven't. A simple, "No." would have sufficed.

I saw no need to try it at this time.

I saw in the other thread where some said it was successful.

But I also see in this thread where components are left behind.

If components are left behind, is incomplete if not a failure.

It is possible for one to be successful and another to fail.

Whether I would succeed or fail would not prove whether others can succeed or fail.

All it would prove is what my computer did.

>  
>> But both your descriptions do little to suggest it was successful.  
>  
> The fact four people (one a highly respected MVP) posted in the original  
> thread that it worked and the systems were functional and one stated he  
> does it all the time, suggests it was successful. The fact that a few  
> program items specific to SP2 that were left over were no longer  
> functional is not all that surprising to me.

I have never disputed whether it was possible.

But in the specific instances where there are SP-2 components left behind, indicates potential problems.

>  
>> The listed problems suggest otherwise and I would not accept the  
>> uninstallation with those listed problems as a successful uninstall.  
>  
> Repair installations do not affect installed programs, remember? Only  
> system files and embedded components of the SP level used for the repair  
> installation.

I was not referring to other programs, this discussion is about Windows.

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

>  
>> If you do, that is up to you and your computer.  
>  
> I tested it mostly out of curiosity. Many times in the past I and others  
> have performed repair installations of various versions of Windows using  
> prior service pack level installation CDs, knowing full well that any  
> existing hotfixes, patches and service packs not included in that CD would  
> not be present afterwards and any software or OS components dependent on  
> hotfixes, patches or service packs not included on the install media that  
> are left over may not function.  
>  
>> I prefer something more definitive than SP-1 displayed in winver and some  
>> inoperative functions.  
>>  
>  
> Then test it for yourself and you tell us. Saying something is askew  
> without your experience for proof is pretty meaningless. I prefer to  
> actually test things and find results, not speculate.

If and when I ever do it does not change the facts others have experienced.  
You may choose to call it successfull with SP-2 components remaining, I  
would not.

Appearing function properly is not an assurance all is OK.

>  
> I intend to test this futher and I'll let you know what I find out. I  
> apologize, but due to another OS experiment, I reformatted my test machine  
> and will need to conduct the experiment again but I will do my best to  
> supply as complete and accurate information as I can to satisfy your  
> questions and comments.  
>  
> Steve  
>

I may test for myself.

But it seems we have differing views and criteria for success.

For me and my computers, I would consider the OS suspect and do what was  
necessary to fix it.

If a Clean Installation was necessary, that is what I would do.

You seem to be satisfied with SP-1 functionality and what is reported by  
winver ignoring SP-2 components seen and unseen..

---

• **Follow-Ups:**

◆ **Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM**

◇ From: Steve N.

• **References:**

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

◆ **Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM**

◇ From: Jupiter Jones [MVP]

◆ **Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM**

◇ From: Steve N.

- Prev by Date: **Re: Drive Letter Access**
- Next by Date: **Re: Realtex**
- Previous by thread: **Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM**
- Next by thread: **Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM**
- Index(es):
  - ◆ **Date**
  - ◆ **Thread**