

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

Source:

<http://www.tech-archive.net/Archive/WinXP/microsoft.public.windowsxp.general/2005-06/msg00104.html>

- *From:* "Steve N." <me@xxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Tue, 31 May 2005 23:30:51 GMT
-

Jupiter Jones [MVP] wrote:

It is easily determined by his own description that it is not behaving as SP-1, not speculating at all :

"Some of the SP2 icons remained in the Control Panel"

"I clicked on the Security Center icon..."

"Clicking on the Windows Firewall and Wireless Network Setup Wizard icons just threw up error messages."

I saw the same things in my experiments, except the wireless setup wizard (I don't have wireless, perhaps that's why). Those were the only anomalies I saw.

Those all indicate possible problems related to the uninstall of SP-2.

Possibly, but the operating system functioned perfectly fine as SP1.

And that is only what is seen, what about what is not seen?
What assurances do you have?

The assurance I have is what I know from experience and study about repair installations (aka in-place upgrades), what they do and what they don't do. They replace operating system files and embedded system components relative to the service pack level being used for the repair install. SP1 doesn't know about the Firewall and Security Center control panel items of SP2. Apparently they are more along the lines of applications (applets), and they were rendered non-functional because they apparently depend on SP2 versions of system files, which were replaced by SP1 versions by the SP1 repair install. The errors stated "a

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

file needed was not found" indicates that.

Have you checked all the files to be sure all are the correct version?
"the actual system files in use are SP1 versions"

I assumed they were SP1 versions or the system would not function correctly and Windows File Protection would have kicked in if a protected system file was the wrong version.

How did you verify all of them?

I didn't, I admit I made the assumption since the systems worked fine for me and others.

"as I'm sure any SP2 specific registry"
"since they are no longer tied to the OS"

You're snipping my sentences so they don't make complete sense. I wish you wouldn't do that. It's misleading and confusing.

Why are you sure?
What demonstrates all necessary files are correct?

The fact that it works.

How do you know what is tied to what?

By paying attention and learning from the experiment, I'm still learning, BTW.

I do not need to attempt this, I have not stated either way whether it will work or not.

I didn't say you should try it or that you said it would or would not work, you said his system is not behaving like an sp1 installation:

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

Jupiter Jones [MVP] wrote:

Yours is not a good example.
Your computer is also not behaving as an SP-1 installation.

And I asked:

"How can you determine that it is not behaving like an SP1 installation?
Have you done it and are you using a machine that you've done it to?"

Obviously you haven't. A simple, "No." would have sufficed.

But both your descriptions do little to suggest it was successful.

The fact four people (one a highly respected MVP) posted in the original thread that it worked and the systems were functional and one stated he does it all the time, suggests it was successful. The fact that a few program items specific to SP2 that were left over were no longer functional is not all that surprising to me.

The listed problems suggest otherwise and I would not accept the uninstallation with those listed problems as a successful uninstall.

Repair installations do not affect installed programs, remember? Only system files and embedded components of the SP level used for the repair installation.

If you do, that is up to you and your computer.

I tested it mostly out of curiosity. Many times in the past I and others have performed repair installations of various versions of Windows using prior service pack level installation CDs, knowing full well that any existing hotfixes, patches and service packs not included in that CD would not be present afterwards and any software or OS components dependent on hotfixes, patches or service packs not included on the install media that are left over may not function.

Re: Repair XP SP2 installation with XP SP1 CD-ROM

I prefer something more definitive than SP-1 displayed in winver and some inoperative functions.

Then test it for yourself and you tell us. Saying something is askew without your experience for proof is pretty meaningless. I prefer to actually test things and find results, not speculate.

I intend to test this futher and I'll let you know what I find out. I apologize, but due to another OS experiment, I reformatted my test machine and will need to conduct the experiment again but I will do my best to supply as complete and accurate information as I can to satisfy your questions and comments.

Steve